

What horizontal and vertical policy (in-)coherencies as regards forest restoration and forest conservation in Europe?

Dr. Metodi Sotirov, Ass. Professor University of Freiburg, SUPERB WP5 Deputy Leader, Metodi.Sotirov@ifp.uni-freiburg.de

In collaboration with BIOCONSENT - Decision-making Support for Forest Biodiversity Conservation and Restoration Policy and Management in Europe (BioDiversa Era Net BiodivRestore, April 2022-March 2025)



SUPERB- Systemic solutions for upscaling of urgent ecosystem restoration for forest related biodiversity and ecosystem services (December 2021 – November 2025)



This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 101036849.

forest-restoration.eu

Key basic terms and definitions



- What is a policy?
- a set of goals (e.g., forest restoration), instruments (e.g., regulations, subsidies, information) and settings (e.g., 10% forest set asides by 2030) to influence practice (e.g., forest management)

• What is policy coherence and policy incoherence?

Policy coherence	Policy incoherence
Policy goals can be simultaneously achieved without any significant trade-off	Policy goals cannot be attained simultaneously due to major contradictions
Policy instruments and practices work together to support a policy goal	Policy instruments and practices that work against each other are counterproductive to policy goals

- Vertical policy (in-)coherence: across levels of governance (EU national subnational)
- Horizontal policy (in-)coherence: across sectors (forestry, biodiversity, climate, agriculture)

Overview of forest restoration policy (in-) coherencies in Europe

- Many policies at multiple levels with different policy objectives (priorities)
- European policies meet with a variety of existing national forest policies

Priority Level	Bioenergy and Carbon (HWP) Forestry	Wood Yield Forestry	Multi-Purpose Forestry	Carbon Forest Management (Forest Sinks)	Forest Biodiversity Conservation
Global					
Pan-Europe					
European Union					·
National forest policy priorities					



Overview of forest restoration policy (in-) coherencies in Europe

- Many policies at multiple levels with different policy objectives (priorities)
- European policies meet with a variety of existing national forest policies

Priority Level	Bioenergy and Carbon (HWP) Forestry	Wood Yield Forestry	Multi-Purpose Forestry	Carbon Forest Management (Forest Sinks)	Forest Biodiversity Conservation
Global		(ITTO, FLEGT)	UNFF / IAF FSC/PEFC	UNFCCC (REDD)	CBD
Pan-Europe			Forest Europe SFM C&I		
European Union	RED II+III Bioeconomy Strategy (LULUCF Reg)	(Bioeconomy Strategy) EUTR/FLEGT	CAP Rural Development Regulation (Forest Strategy)	Green Deal LULUCF Reg. Fit for 55 (Bioeconomy Strategy)	Green Deal Forest Strategy Biodiversity Strategy Nature Restoration Draft Law Habitats/Birds Directives Deforestation Reg.
National forest policy priorities	North, Central & Eastern Europe	North & Eastern Europe	Central & Eastern Europe	Western Europe	Western & Southern Europe





Multi-level and multi-sector policy and legal (in-) coherencies

Main policy trade-off: wood use vs. forest biodiversity conservation •







Illustrative examples for policy coherencies: EU Birds/Habitats Directives (Natura 2000) and EU Nature Restoration (Draft) Law

- Art. 18 EU Habitats Directive Reporting and EU's State of Nature Report (2020, EEA 2020):
- 81% of forest habitats in Natura 2000 sites show unfavourable conservation status (a need for restoration!!!)
- <u>Forestry</u> assessed to be the 1st largest pressure for forest habitats and 2nd largest for species
- Negative impacts by <u>clearcutting</u>, <u>salvage logging</u>, <u>reduction of old-</u> <u>growth forests</u>, <u>removal of dead</u>, <u>dying</u> <u>and old trees</u>

Figure 4b: Conservation status per habitat group at EU level



Note: The number of assessments per group is indicated in parentheses. Marine habitats are part of the 'coastal habitats' group. The total number of assessments is 818.

Illustrative examples for policy coherencies: EU Nature Restoration (Draft) Law and EU Birds/Habitats Directives (Natura 2000)



• EU Nature Restoration Law (NRL) (legislative proposal as of June 2022)



Article 10 Restoration of forest ecosystems

- 1. Member States shall put in place the restoration measures necessary to enhance biodiversity of forest ecosystems, in addition to the areas that are subject to restoration measures pursuant to Article 4(1), (2) and (3).
- 2. Member States shall achieve an increasing trend at national level of each of the following indicators in forest ecosystems, as further set out in Annex VI, measured in the period from the date of entry into force of this Regulation until 31 December 2030, and every three years thereafter, until the satisfactory levels identified in accordance with Article 11(3) are reached:
 - (a) standing deadwood;
 - (b) lying deadwood;
 - (c) share of forests with uneven-aged structure;
 - (d) forest connectivity;
 - (e) common forest bird index;
 - (f) stock of organic carbon.



Illustrative examples for policy (in-) coherencies: EU Nature Restoration Draft Law and national forest laws

Regulating clearcutting with relevance to NRL § 10, 2c indicator "share of forests with uneven-aged structure"

Group 1	Group 2	Group 3			
Clearcutting	Clearcutting	Clearcutting			
banned by	allowed by	allowed by			
law, with	law, but	law, without			
socio-	diverse	clearcut size			
ecological	clearcut size	limits			
exemptions	limits				
BG, IT, SLK,	AT, BE, CZ,	DK, FIN, FR,			
SLO	DE, EE, LT,	IRL, PT, SP, SE,			
	LIT, PL, RO,	UK			
	NL				





Illustrative examples for policy (in-) coherencies: EU Nature Restoration Draft Law and national forest laws



Regulating short-term mandatory reforestation with relevance to NRL § 10, 2c indicator "share of forests with uneven-aged structure"

		From?	Heasite Notific	ation from mat	width prob	ibited? Mat. 8	les ned Rest	ictions?	Obli	93tory? From	atea site period	in years Extension	orber	
Austria			0,5 ha	50 m	no	2-3 ha	yes		yes	-	5-10 years	5 years		
Belgium		0,5-3 ha	-	-	no	10-25; 1-5	yes		-	-	-	-		
Bulgaria		(2 ha)	-	-	yes	-	yes		yes	-	1	-		
Czech Rep.		-	-	-	no	1-2 ha	yes		yes	-	2	-		
Denmark		-	-	-	no	-	no		yes	-	10	-		
Estonia		-	-	-	no	-	-		yes	1 ha	3			
Finland		-	-	-	no	-	no		yes	-	10-25	-		
France		1-10 ha	-	-	no	-	no		yes	-	5	-		Common approach
Germany		-	2 ha	-	no/yes	-	yes		yes	-	3-5	-		toward mandatorv
Ireland	5	-	-	-	no	-	no		yes	-	-	-		referention
Italy	tin	-	-	-	yes	(2 ha)	yes	atio	-	-	-	-		reiorestation
Latvia	cut	-	-	50 -100 m	no	5-10 ha	-	esta	yes	-	3	-		(planting!) within
Netherlands	ear	0,5 ha	0,5 ha	-	no	-	no	Įõ	yes	-	-	-		short time period !
Poland	ΰ	-	-	-	no	6 ha	-	Rei	yes	-	5	-		short time period :
Portugal		-	-	-	no	(2 ha)	yes		-	-				
Romania		-	-	-	no	3-5 ha	yes		yes	-	2	-		
Slovakia		-	-	2 aver. tree length of the parent stand	yes/no	3-5 ha	-		yes	-	2	10 years		
Slovenia	1	-	-	-	yes	-	-		yes	-	-	-		
Spain	1				no		no		yes		5			
Sweden	1	-	0,5 ha	-	no	20-50 ha	no/yes		yes	-	3	-		
Switzerland]	-	-	-	yes	-	-		yes	-	no	-		
UK		-	-	-	no	-	no		ves	-	10	-		

Summary conclusions



- Definition of policy coherence and policy incoherence
- Horizontal: policy tradeoffs/synergies across sectors (forestry, biodiversity, climate, agriculture,...)
- Vertical: policy tradeoffs/synergies acrorss levels (global EU national subnational)
- Regulation of forest restoration and forest conservation in Europe
- Subject to mutiple EU forest related policies and laws
- EU policies meet with diversity of long existing national forest policies and laws
- Main policy trade-off: timber use vs. forest biodiversity conservation
- Open questions:
- Where can policy synergies be identified?
- How to manage policy trade-offs?

References (selected)

- Fleckenstein, S.; Basilicata, A., Sotirov, M. (2023). SS5.1.2: Restoration policy coherence assessment. Horizon 2020 Project No. 101036849, European Commission, 23 pp.
- Sotirov, M. (2022). M5.1 Methodological framework for assessment of policy coherence. Horizon 2020 Project No. 101036849 (SUPERB), European Commission, 28 pp.
- Sotirov, M., Winkel, G., Eckerberg, K. (2021): The coalitional politics of the European Union's environmental forest policy: Biodiversity conservation, timber legality, and climate protection. *AMBIO A Journal of the Human Environment* L (12) December 2021: 2153-2167.
- Sotirov, M., Schulz, T., Winkel, G. (2020): Policy and legal framework for integrating production and biodiversity conservation in European forests. In Krumm, F.; Schuck, A.; Rigling, A. (eds), 2020: How to balance forestry and biodiversity conservation – A view across Europe. European Forest Institute (EFI); Swiss Federal Institute for Forest, Snow and Landscape Research (WSL), Birmensdorf, Switzerland.
- Baulenas, E., **Sotirov, M.** (2020): Cross-sectoral policy integration at the forest and water nexus: National level instrument choices and integration drivers in the European Union. *Forest Policy and Economics* 118 (2020): 102247.
- Wolfslehner, B., Pülzl, H., Kleinschmit, D., Aggestam, F., Winkel, G., Candel, J., Eckerberg, K., Feindt, P., McDermott, C., Secco, L., Sotirov, M., Lackner, M., Roux, J.-L. (2020): European forest governance post-2020. From Science to Policy 10. European Forest Institute. DOI: https://doi.org/10.36333/fs10; ISBN 978-952-5980-84-4 (print); ISBN 978-952-5980-85-1 (online)
- Sotirov, M., Arts, B. (2018): Integrated Forest Governance in Europe: An Introduction to the Special Issue on Forest Policy Integration and Integrated Forest Management. *Land Use Policy* 79 (2018): 960-967.
- Sotirov, M., Storch, S. (2018): Resilience through policy integration in Europe? Domestic forest policy changes as response to absorb pressure to integrate biodiversity conservation, bioenergy use and climate protection in France, Germany, the Netherlands and Sweden. *Land Use Policy* 79 (2018): 977-989.
- Sotirov, M. ed. (2017): Natura 2000 and forests: Assessing the state of implementation and effectiveness. What Science Can Tell Us 7. European Forest Institute. ISBN 978-952-5980-37-0 (printed), ISBN 978-952-5980-38-7 (pdf).
- Winkel, G., **Sotirov, M.** (2016): Whose integration is this? European forest policy between the gospel of coordination, institutional competition, and a new spirit of integration. Environment and Planning C: *Government and Policy* 34 (3): 496-514.





Thank you!

💓 @SUPERB_project

Dr. Metodi Sotirov, Ass. Professor University of Freiburg, SUPERB WP5 Deputy Leader, Metodi.Sotirov@ifp.uni-freiburg.de

In collaboration with BIOCONSENT - Decision-making Support for Forest Biodiversity Conservation and Restoration Policy and Management in Europe (BioDiversa Era Net BiodivRestore, April 2022-March 2025)





This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 101036849.